



## MINUTES OF A MEETING OF THE CLIFTON TO TANGOIO COASTAL HAZARDS STRATEGY JOINT COMMITTEE

**Date:** Monday 5 December 2016

**Time:** 10.00am

**Venue:** Council Chamber  
Hawke's Bay Regional Council  
159 Dalton Street  
NAPIER

**Present:** Peter Beaven – HBRC  
Paul Bailey – HBRC  
Rex Graham – HBRC Ex-Officio Member  
Tony Jeffery – NCC  
Larry Dallimore – NCC  
Tania Kerr - HDC  
Rod Heaps – HDC  
Ann Redstone – HDC Alternate Member  
Tania Hopmans – Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust (Skype)  
Peter Paku – He Toa Takitini

**In Attendance:** Simon Bendall – Mitchell Daysh  
Mike Adye – HBRC  
James Palmer – HBRC  
Monique Thomsen – HBRC  
James Minehan – NCC  
Dean Moriarity – NCC  
Mark Clews – HDC  
Emma Ryan – Living at the Edge

## 1. Welcome/Apologies

Mr Mike Adye welcomed everyone to the first meeting of the triennium and outlined the process for the meeting, acknowledging Ms Tania Hopmans who was in attendance via Skype.

### CLI42/16 Resolution:

That apologies from Mayor Bill Dalton be accepted.

**Received by the Chairman**

## 2. Conflict of Interest Declarations

There were no conflict of interest declarations.

## 3. CONFIRMATION OF JOINT COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Mr Mike Adye acknowledged letters received from the Councils confirming their appointed representatives onto the Committee.

The Committee members are:

- Napier City Council:  
*Councillor Tony Jeffery and Councillor Larry Dallimore*
- Hastings District Council:  
*Councillor Tania Kerr and Councillor Rodney Heaps, with Councillor Ann Redstone as Alternate*
- Hawke's Bay Regional Council:  
*Councillor Peter Beaven and Councillor Paul Bailey*
- Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust:  
*Mrs Tania Hopmans*
- Mana Ahuriri Inc:  
*Mr Piri Prentice*
- He Toa Takitini:  
*Mr Peter Paku*

### CLI43/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Confirmation of Joint Committee Members** report.

**Kerr/Heaps  
CARRIED**

## 4. ELECTION OF CHAIR AND DEPUTY CHAIR

The paper was taken as read.

Mr Mike Adye welcomed nominations from the Committee for the position of the Chair.

Councillor Tony Jeffery nominated Councillor Peter Beaven for the role of Chairperson, seconded by Councillor Tania Kerr.

There being no further nominations, Councillor Peter Beaven accepted the nomination and was elected unopposed.

Mr Adye relinquished the Chair and Councillor Beaven assumed the Chair.

Mr Beaven thanked the Committee for the nomination. He spoke of the work done to date and the importance of the commitment of the three Councils and Tangata Whenua members to working together and looking towards the challenges ahead in the next phase of the Strategy. Mr Beaven also spoke of sea level rise and provided an example of the effects of the recent earthquakes and tsunami warnings on the insurance industry, which had affected the sale of coastal property in Hawke's Bay because people were unable to secure insurance.

Mr Beaven welcomed nominations for the position of Deputy Co-Chairs.

Councillor Rod Heaps nominated Councillor Tania Kerr for the role of Deputy Co-Chairperson, seconded by Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust representative Tania Hopmans.

Councillor Larry Dallimore nominated Councillor Tony Jeffery for the role of Deputy Co-Chairperson, seconded by Councillor Paul Bailey.

There being no further nominations, Councillor Tania Kerr and Councillor Tony Jeffery both accepted the nomination and were elected as Deputy Co-Chairpersons.

CLI44/16 **Resolutions:**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee:

1. Elects Councillor Peter Beaven as the Chairperson of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee;

**Jeffery/Kerr  
CARRIED**

2. Elects Tania Kerr as the Deputy Chairperson of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee

**Heaps/Hopmans  
CARRIED**

3. Elects Tony Jeffery as the Deputy Chairperson of the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee

**Dallimore/Bailey  
CARRIED**

**5. JOINT COMMITTEE TERMS OF REFERENCE**

Mr Simon Bendall provided an update on the Joint Committee Terms of Reference. As the committee has reformed post the recent local body election, it was an opportune time to review the terms of reference, and changes which have been proposed by the Technical Advisory Group which reflected how the Strategy had evolved since it was first confirmed in late 2014.

The Committee discussed the Terms of Reference and agreed some wording required further refining.

The Committee also noted that approval from the Mana Ahuriri Incorporated representative for the proposed changes was required before going to the Councils for adoption. The Technical Advisory Group would seek this approval.

CLI45/16 **Resolutions:**

That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee:

1. Receives and notes the **Joint Committee Terms of Reference** report.
2. Recommends the attached updated Terms of Reference to the Hawke's Bay Regional Council, Hastings District Council and Napier City Council for adoption.

**Jeffery/Heaps  
CARRIED**

## 6. LIVING AT THE EDGE

Mr Simon Bendall welcomed Ms Emma Ryan of Living at the Edge to the meeting.

Mr Bendall provided an overview of the work the Technical Advisory Group are doing in conjunction with the Living at the Edge project team and outlined the integrated work plan which has been developed.

Ms Ryan introduced herself and provided background information on the Edge team.

It was noted the Ministry for the Environment national guidance has been delayed. Members of the Edge team were contributing to the guidance document. It was also noted that the Ministry have advised the Technical Advisory Group that there is a high degree of consistency between the approach in Hawke's Bay and the draft national-level guidance.

CLI46/16

### Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the ***Living at the Edge*** report.

Kerr/Bailey  
CARRIED

## 7. STAGE 2: DECISION MAKING FRAMEWORK - PROGRESS UPDATE

Mr Simon Bendall provided an update on the ongoing development of the decision-making framework developed in Stage 2 of the Strategy that would be used to identify responses to coastal hazards risks.

Mr Bendall noted that due to the Ministry for the Environment national guidance being delayed and embargoed until it is formally released by the Minister in the New Year, Mr Stephen Daysh was unable to update the draft decision making framework report to reflect it. While informal discussions have confirmed a high degree of alignment, it is important that the Strategy is able to formally reflect and reference this national guidance.

Once the guidance is publicly available the Stage 2 decision making framework report would be updated and presented to the Joint Committee in 2017. Mr Bendall noted that this delay would not affect progress implementing Stage 3 of the Strategy.

CLI47/16

### Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the ***Stage 2: Decision Making Framework – Progress Update*** report.

Kerr/Heaps  
CARRIED

## 8. STAGE 2: FUNDING MODEL - PROGRESS UPDATE

Mr Simon Bendall provided an update on the ongoing development of a funding model to determine how the costs of responding to coastal hazards risks would be met.

Mr Mike Abye provided an overview of the meetings he attended with Treasury, EQC and the Ministry for the Environment.

The Committee requested Mr Wayne Mills attends the first Joint Committee meeting in 2017 to provide an update and refresh of the funding model to the Committee.

The Committee discussed the funding model, the development of a coastal response contributory fund and how the panels would incorporate this into their decision making.

CLI48/16

### Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the ***Stage 2: Funding Model – Progress Update*** report.

Jeffery/Bailey  
CARRIED

## 9. STAGE 3 BRIEFING

Mr Simon Bendall provided an update on the commencement of Stage 3 and the planned activity over the coming months which was summarised into the key steps from forming cell assessment panels (Northern and Southern) in December 2016 to the final recommendations made by the Committee to each Partner Council in late 2017.

Mr Peter Beaven spoke on the community meetings held in November to establish the community representatives on each of the assessment panels and outlined the processes undertaken to confirm those representatives.

Handout tabled: a draft list of the northern and southern panel members. The Committee discussed the makeup of both cells, Councillor and Tangata Whenua representatives and also a regional community representative role who would represent the wider community. It was agreed that Tangata Whenua members of the Committee would attend as observer participants on each panel. It was noted some positions were not confirmed as yet which the Technical Advisory Group were following up on. Councillors are to confirm who would be the lead observer participant on each panel.

The Committee suggested the full member, observer and support roles are defined in the draft Terms of Reference setting out the purpose of each of the roles for clarity and that the terms of reference were recommended to each panel to confirm.

Mr Bendall provided an update on the work being done in advance of the panels being formed. He advised that the social impact work being done by Mr Wayne Mills of Maven Consulting was underway, with interviews with members of the public happening this week and next, supported by members of the Edge team. Tonkin & Taylor were also progressing with the preliminary scoping of defend options to support panel deliberations.

The Committee discussed cultural impacts and how these were to be considered. Mr Bendall confirmed that the social impact work being done by Maven would not specifically consider cultural impacts. TAG has sought input from marae on whether or not there were cultural sites of significance at risk from coastal hazards that were not currently captured by the risk assessment, but no information has been received. Mr Bendall noted that the panel process did provide an opportunity for panel members to consider any gaps in the information base and to direct work to be done, and welcomed any advice on how cultural effects could be better understood in the meantime. It was suggested the Tangata Whenua representatives on the Committee meet to identify any further cultural sites noting Maungaharuru-Tangitū Trust had sites of significant identified.

The recommendations were amended to reflect the changes.

CLI49/16

### Resolutions:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Stage 3 Briefing** report.
2. That the amended ToR be recommended to each Evaluation Panel.
3. That the amended evaluation panel as presented be approved.
4. That the 2 Councillors for each Council decide and formally advise this TAG who is the lead Observer Participant for each evaluation panel.
5. That the Tangata Whenua members attend as Observer Participants.
6. That an independent full member (rather than a HBRC Observer Participant) to each evaluation panel is appointed, to representation of the wider community. This person should have ability to be representative of the much wider regional population, rather than coastal.

**Kerr/Heaps  
CARRIED**

## 10. COMMUNICATIONS AND STAKEHOLDER UPDATE

The paper was taken as read.

Mr Simon Bendall noted a newsletter was published in the Hawke's Bay Today newspaper on 10 November 2016 which outlined the public meetings that were held between 14-22 November as part of the process to form the Cell Assessment Panels.

### CLI50/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Communications and Stakeholder Update** report.

Heaps/Dallimore  
CARRIED

## 11. PROJECT MANAGER UPDATE

Mr Simon Bendall spoke of the Coastal Hazards Assessment report Tonkin & Taylor undertook for the Christchurch City Council. The report had been challenged as part of the District Plan review process. A peer review had been conducted to address the concerns raised, and this was now completed. The findings from that review are positive. Tonkin & Taylor used the same methodology in Hawke's Bay and the outcome of this peer review further reinforces that we have sound technical platform that can be relied on as the strategy is developed.

Mr Bendall also noted that a peer review of the inundation assessment for the strategy had recently been completed. When Dr Paul Kench from the University of Auckland was originally engaged to peer review the Tonkin & Taylor hazard assessment work he was only able to review the coastal erosion section, as the inundation section had been delayed. To close this loop, the Technical Advisory Group asked Dr Kench to complete his review of the inundation work. The outcome of the peer review arrived too late to be included in this agenda, however it confirmed the technical work as sound. This would be taken to the next Joint Committee to formally receive the peer review.

### CLI51/16 Resolution:

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the **Project Manager Update** report.

Bailey/Kerr  
CARRIED

## 12. CURRENT COASTAL PROJECTS UPDATE

Mr James Minehan provided an update on the progress to date at Whakarire Avenue. Napier City Council have received resource consent from the Hawke's Bay Regional Council based on a concept plan from Beca. Detailed design has yet to be completed. A copy of the regional consent was tabled. The Committee requested an electronic copy to be circulated and uploaded to the website.

Mr Mike Adye provided an update on the progress to date for the Port of Napier. The application for a consent to extend/build a new wharf and dredging is being worked on and would be filed in 2017.

Mr Mark Clews provided an update on the progress to date on the revetment works in Clifton. A consent is in place for a temporary structure which expires in August 2018, at the same time as the Clifton Marine Club's lease. Mr Clews noted that HDC are required to either remove the wall at the conclusion of the current consent, or seek a new resource consent to continue to protect this area of coast. There is a proposal for an extension of the wall, the design work has been advanced and discussions have taken place with landowners and other key people and indicative funding set aside. This work cannot wait for the completion of the coastal hazard work if something is to be done in time for the consent

expiry deadline, it needs to happen in parallel. In that respect a funding paper is scheduled to go to Council on 15 December where a decision on whether to proceed further will likely be made.

The Committee noted the proposed consent application for a concrete wall at Haumoana to protect properties from erosion. The Committee requested that a regular update on the Haumoana Wall is provided as a standard item going forward.

CLI52/16

**Resolution:**

1. That the Clifton to Tangoio Coastal Hazards Strategy Joint Committee receives and notes the *verbal* **Current Coastal Projects Update** report.

**Jeffery/Bailey  
CARRIED**

**13. OTHER MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION**

Mr Mike Adye advised the Committee he would be retiring from Council on 31 March 2017.

Mr Simon Bendall confirmed the 28 February 2017 Joint Committee meeting would be held at the Napier City Council.

**Closure:**

There being no further business the Chairman declared the meeting closed at 12.20pm on Monday, 5 December 2016.

Signed as a true and correct record.

**DATE:** .....

**CHAIRMAN:** .....

## AGREED ACTION ITEMS

Task	Meeting / Agenda Item	Actions	Resp.	Status/Comment
1.	5 December 2016, item 5	<p>Terms of Reference</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Refine the wording as directed by the Joint Committee.</li> <li>- Mana Ahuriri Inc. to approve the updated ToR.</li> <li>- HDC, NCC, HBRC take the ToR to their Councils to be adopted.</li> </ul>	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- In Progress.</li> <li>- In Progress for March 2017.</li> </ul>
2.	5 December 2016, item 7	<p>Stage 2: Decision Making Framework</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Bring to future Joint Committee to adopt.</li> </ul>	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- On the 28 February 2017 agenda.</li> </ul>
3.	5 December 2016, item 8	<p>Stage 2: Funding Model</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Wayne Mills to attend the next Joint Committee meeting to update/refresh Committee.</li> </ul>	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- On the 28 February 2017 agenda.</li> </ul>
4.	5 December 2016, item 9	<p>Stage 3 Briefing</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Councillors to determine who is representing their Council on the North and South panels and to advise TAG.</li> <li>- Committee nominated Peter Kay to be on a panel, TAG to follow up.</li> <li>- Clarify/define the roles and protocols of the full/observer/support roles on the panel.</li> <li>- Iwi reps to confirm attendance – Northern: Terry Wilson/Tania Hopmans and Southern: Terry Wilson/Peter Paku.</li> <li>- Tania Hopmans/Peter Paku/Terry Wilson to meet to discuss the cultural sites of significance and advise TAG.</li> </ul>	ALL	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- In Progress.</li> </ul>
5.	5 December 2016, item 11	<p>Project Manager Update</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Present coastal inundation peer review findings to future Joint Committee meeting to finalise Stage 1.</li> </ul>	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- On the 28 February 2017 agenda.</li> </ul>
6.	5 December 2016, item 12	<p>Current Coastal Projects Update</p> <p>Whakaririe Ave:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Circulate a copy of the regional consent to the Committee and upload onto website.</li> </ul> <p>Clifton:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Provide a photo of the revetment works.</li> </ul> <p>Other:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Add Haumoana Wall Update to be reported on at each meeting.</li> </ul>	TAG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Completed.</li> <li>- In Progress.</li> <li>- Completed.</li> </ul>